Case 2020AP002007

2025-09-18 Court Order

Filed 09-18-2025

Page 1 of 4

OFFICE OF THE CLERK



FILED
09-18-2025
CLERK OF WISCONSIN
SUPREME COURT

P.O. Box 1688 Madison, WI 53701-1688

> TELEPHONE (608) 266-1880 FACSIMILE (608) 267-0640 Web Site: www.wicourts.gov

> > September 18, 2025

To:

Hon. Kelly J. Thimm Circuit Court Judge

Electronic Notice

Michele Wick

Clerk of Circuit Court

Douglas County Courthouse Electronic Notice

Charlotte Gibson Electronic Notice

Eric C. Rassbach Electronic Notice Nicholas R. Reaves Electronic Notice

Colin Thomas Roth Electronic Notice

Andrew John Rubsam Electronic Notice

Jeffrey J. Shampo Electronic Notice

*Distribution list continued on Pages 3 & 4

You are hereby notified that the Court has entered the following order:

No. 2020AP2007 <u>Catholic Charities Bureau, Inc. v. Wisconsin Labor and Industry</u> Review Commission, L.C. #2019CV324

On June 5, 2025, the United States Supreme Court issued its decision in <u>Catholic Charities Bureau</u>, <u>Inc. v. LIRC</u>, 145 S. Ct. 1583 (2025), which reviewed our decision in <u>Catholic Charities Bureau</u>, <u>Inc. v. LIRC</u>, 2024 WI 13, 411 Wis. 2d 1, 3 N.W.3d 666. On July 7, 2025, the clerk of this court received the United States Supreme Court's mandate and judgment, both of which state that "the judgment of [this court] is reversed with costs, and the case is remanded to [this court] for further proceedings not inconsistent with" the Supreme Court's opinion.

On July 9 and 10, 2025, the parties filed letters briefly stating their positions regarding the appropriate remedial measures to be taken in light of the Supreme Court's opinion in <u>Catholic</u> Charities Bureau, Inc. v. LIRC, 145 S. Ct. 1583 (2025).

The court has decided it would benefit from formal briefing on this issue.

Case 2020AP002007 2025-09-18 Court Order Filed 09-18-2025 Page 2 of 4

Page 2 September 18, 2025 No. 2020AP2007

Catholic Charities Bureau Inc. v. Wisconsin Labor and Industry Review Commission, L.C. #2019CV324

Accordingly,

IT IS ORDERED that, within 30 days of the date of this order, the parties shall file simultaneous briefs regarding the appropriate remedial measures to be taken in light of the Supreme Court's opinion in <u>Catholic Charities Bureau</u>, <u>Inc. v. LIRC</u>, 145 S. Ct. 1583 (2025); and

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the parties shall file simultaneous response briefs by no more than 14 days from the date their initial briefs are filed.

REBECCA GRASSL BRADLEY, J., with whom ANNETTE KINGSLAND ZIEGLER, J., joins, dissenting.

Four members of this court committed a colossal error in denying Catholic Charities a tax exemption the legislature clearly conferred on religious entities. Cath. Charities Bureau, Inc. v. LIRC, 2024 WI 13, ¶110-198, 411 Wis. 2d 1, 3 N.W.3d 666 (Rebecca Grassl Bradley, J., dissenting). A unanimous United States Supreme Court corrected the error, noting "[t]here may be hard calls to make in policing" the constitutionally guaranteed neutrality of government toward religions but "this is not one." Cath. Charities Bureau, Inc. v. Wis. Lab. & Indus. Rev. Comm'n, 605 U.S. 238, 254, 145 S. Ct. 1583, 221 L. Ed. 2d 881 (2025). Procedurally, there is nothing left for this court to do but set aside the erroneous decision of the Wisconsin Labor & Industry Review Commission (LIRC) to deny Catholic Charities the statutory tax exemption. Instead, the majority falls for LIRC's suggestion that an issue remains undecided and orders the parties to brief the appropriate remedy for the State's First Amendment violation, Inexplicably convinced "it would benefit from formal briefing on this issue," the majority orders the parties to brief "the appropriate remedial measures to be taken in light of the Supreme Court's opinion." Perhaps encouraged by the majority's recent decision to erase a duly enacted law from the statutes (see Kaul v. Urmanski, 2025 WI 32, ¶73, 417 Wis. 2d 257, 22 N.W.3d 740 (Rebecca Grassl Bradley, J., dissenting)), LIRC invites this court to nullify the statute granting religious entities an exemption from the unemployment tax. LIRC fools the majority into believing there is a problem with the *law* rather than LIRC's interpretation of it.

The United States Supreme Court couldn't have been clearer, but the majority nevertheless remains confused. By unnecessarily prolonging the disposition of this matter, the majority wastes even more taxpayer dollars on litigation that should have ended years ago, but for the mistakes of the court of appeals and this court. Even worse, after rendering a ruling in violation of the First Amendment, the majority risks compounding its errors by entertaining LIRC's new argument on "remedy." This court should not need additional briefing to confirm the obvious. I dissent.

Page 3

September 18, 2025

No. 2020AP2007 <u>Catholic Charities Bureau Inc. v. Wisconsin Labor and Industry</u>

Review Commission, L.C. #2019CV324

Address list continued:

Kyle H. Torvinen Electronic Notice

Daniel M. Vitagliano Electronic Notice

Rohit P. Asirvatham Sarah M. Harris Mark S. Storslee Williams & Connolly LLP 680 Maine Avenue SW Washington, DC 20024

Jon P. Axelrod J. Wesley Webendorfer DeWitt Ross & Stevens S.C. 2 E. Mifflin St., Ste. 600 Madison, WI 53703-2865

Robert S. Driscoll Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren S.C. P.O. Box 2965 Milwaukee, WI 53202

David Earleywine Wisconsin Catholic Conference 106 E. Doty St., Ste. 300 Madison, WI 53703

Patrick C. Elliott Freedom From Religion Foundation P.O. Box 750 Madison, WI 53701

Zachary Faircloth
Bradley G. Hubbard
Elizabeth A. Kiernan
Jason J. Meuhlhoff
Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP
2001 Ross Avenue
Dallas, TX 75201-2923

Timothy John Feldhausen Amundsen Davis LLC 318 South Washington Street Green Bay, 54301

Matthew M.Fernholz Cramer, Multhauf & Hammes, LLP 1601 East Racine Avenue, Suite 200 Waukesha, WI 53187

Caleb Raymond Gerbitz James M. Sosnoski Meissner, Tierney, Fisher & Nichols S.C. 111 E. Kilbourn Avenue, Ste. 1900 Milwaukee, WI 53703

Samuel Grover Freedom From Religion Foundation 10 N. Henry St. Madison, WI 53703

Benjamin Hayes Levi Swank Goodwin Law 1900 N. Street N.W. Washington, DC 20036

Gregory Heinen
David W. Simon
Foley & Lardner LLP
777 E. Wisconsin Ave., Ste. 3600
Milwaukee, WI 53202-5306

Jonathan Judge ArentFox Schiff LLP 233 South Wacker Dr., Ste. 7100 Chicago, IL 60606

Stephen M. Judge South Bank Legal 100 E. Wayne Street, Ste. 300 South Bend, IN 46601 Page 4

September 18, 2025

No. 2020AP2007 <u>Catholic Charities Bureau Inc. v. Wisconsin Labor and Industry</u> Review Commission, L.C. #2019CV324

Address list continued:

Tiernan Kane South Bank Legal 100 E. Wayne Street, Ste. 300 South Bend, IN 46601

Dina Ljekperic Goodwin Law 620 Eighth Ave. New York, NY 10018-1618

James C. Phillips Schaerr Jaffe LLP 1717 K. Street N.W., Ste. 900 Washington, DC 20006

Gene C. Schaerr Schaerr Jaffe LLP 1717 K. Street N.W., Ste. 900 Washington, DC 20006

Howard Slugh Jewish Coalition For Religious Liberty 2400 Virginia Ave. N.W., Apt. C619 Washington, DC 20037

Daniel R. Suhr Hughes & Suhr LLC 747 LaSalle St., Ste. 210 Chicago, IL 60654 John David Tripoli Eimer Stahl LLP 224 S. Michigan Ave., 11th Floor Chicago, IL 60654

Ryan J. Walsh Eimer Stahl LLP 10 E. Doty St., Ste. 621 Madison, WI 53703

Tiffany E. Woelfel Amundsen Davis LLC 318 South Washington Street Green Bay, WI 54301