# The American Law Institute

DAVID F. LEVI, President
ROBERTA COOPER RAMO, Chair of the Council
DOUGLAS LAYCOCK, 1st Vice President
LEE H. ROSENTHAL, 2nd Vice President
WALLACE B. JEFFERSON, Treasurer
PAUL L. FRIEDMAN, Secretary
RICHARD L. REVESZ, Director
STEPHANIE A. MIDDLETON, Deputy Director

COUNCIL KIM J. ASKEW, K&L Gates, Dallas, TX JOSÉ I. ASTIGARRAGA, Reed Smith, Miami, FL DONALD B. AYER, Jones Day, Washington, DC SCOTT BALES, Arizona Supreme Court, Phoenix, AZ JOHN H. BEISNER, Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom, Washington, DC JOHN B. BELLINGER III, Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP, Washington, DC AMELIA H. BOSS, Drexel University Thomas R. Kline School of Law, Philadelphia, PA ELIZABETH J. CABRASER, Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, San Francisco, CA EVAN R. CHESLER, Cravath, Swaine & Moore, New York, NY MARIANO-FLORENTINO CUÉLLAR, California Supreme Court, San Francisco, CA IVAN K. FONG, 3M Company, St. Paul, MN KENNETH C. FRAZIER, Merck & Co., Inc., Kenilworth, NJ PAUL L. FRIEDMAN, U.S. District Court, District of Columbia, Washington, DC STEVEN S. GENSLER, University of Oklahoma College of Law, Norman, OK ABBE R. GLUCK, Yale Law School, New Haven, CT YVONNE GONZALEZ ROGERS, U.S. District Court, Northern District of California, Oakland, CA ANTON G. HAJJAR, Chevy Chase, MD TERESA WILTON HARMON, Sidley Austin, Chicago, IL NATHAN L. HECHT, Texas Supreme Court, Austin, TX WILLIAM C. HUBBARD, Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough, Columbia, SC SAMUEL ISSACHAROFF, New York University School of Law, New York, NY KETANJI BROWN JACKSON, U.S. District Court for the District of Columbia, Washington, DC WALLACE B. JEFFERSON, Alexander Dubose & Jefferson LLP, Austin, TX GREGORY P. JOSEPH, Joseph Hage Aaronson LLC, New York, NY MICHELE C. KANE, The Walt Disney Company, Burbank, CA HAROLD HONGJU KOH, Yale Law School, New Haven, CT CAROLYN B. KUHL, Superior Court of California, County of Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA CAROLYN B. LAMM, White & Case, Washington, DC DEREK P. LANGHAUSER, Office of the Governor, Augusta, ME DOUGLAS LAYCOCK, University of Virginia School of Law, Charlottesville, VA; University of Texas at Austin School of Law, Austin, TX CAROL F. LEE, Taconic Capital Advisors, New York, NY DAVID F. LEVI, Duke University School of Law, Durham, NC LANCE LIEBMAN\*, Columbia Law School, New York, NY GOODWIN LIU, California Supreme Court, San Francisco, CA RAYMOND J. LOHIER, JR., U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, New York, NY GERARD E. LYNCH, U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, New York, NY MARGARET H. MARSHALL, Choate Hall & Stewart, Boston, MA LORI A. MARTIN, WilmerHale, New York, NY TROY A. MCKENZIE, New York University School of Law, New York, NY M. MARGARET MCKEOWN, U.S. Court of Appeals, Ninth Circuit, San Diego, CA JUDITH A. MILLER, Chevy Chase, MD PATRICIA ANN MILLETT, U.S. Court of Appeals, District of Columbia Circuit, Washington, DC JANET NAPOLITANO, University of California, Oakland, CA

KATHRYN A. OBERLY, District of Columbia Court of Appeals (retired), Washington, DC

KATHLEEN M. O'SULLIVAN, Perkins Coie, Seattle, WA

<sup>\*</sup>Director Emeritus

STEPHANIE E. PARKER, Jones Day, Atlanta, GA STUART RABNER, New Jersey Supreme Court, Trenton, NJ ROBERTA COOPER RAMO\*, Modrall Sperling, Albuquerque, NM DAVID W. RIVKIN, Debevoise & Plimpton, New York, NY DANIEL B. RODRIGUEZ, Northwestern University Pritzker School of Law, Chicago, IL LEE H. ROSENTHAL, U.S. District Court, Southern District of Texas, Houston, TX GARY L. SASSO, Carlton Fields, Tampa, FL ANTHONY J. SCIRICA, U.S. Court of Appeals, Third Circuit, Philadelphia, PA MARSHA E. SIMMS, Weil, Gotshal & Manges (retired), New York, NY ROBERT H. SITKOFF, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, MA JANE STAPLETON, Christ's College, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, England LAURA STEIN, The Clorox Company, Oakland, CA LARRY S. STEWART, Stewart Tilghman Fox Bianchi & Cain, Miami, FL ELIZABETH S. STONG, U.S. Bankruptcy Court, Eastern District of New York, Brooklyn, NY CATHERINE T. STRUVE, University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, PA JEFFREY S. SUTTON, U.S. Court of Appeals, Sixth Circuit, Columbus, OH SARAH S. VANCE, U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Louisiana, New Orleans, LA SETH P. WAXMAN, WilmerHale, Washington, DC STEVEN O. WEISE, Proskauer Rose, Los Angeles, CA DIANE P. WOOD, U.S. Court of Appeals, Seventh Circuit, Chicago, IL

### COUNCIL EMERITI

KENNETH S. ABRAHAM, University of Virginia School of Law, Charlottesville, VA SHIRLEY S. ABRAHAMSON, Wisconsin Supreme Court, Madison, WI PHILIP S. ANDERSON, Williams & Anderson, Little Rock, AR SUSAN FRELICH APPLETON, Washington University School of Law, St. Louis, MO SHEILA L. BIRNBAUM, Dechert LLP, New York, NY ALLEN D. BLACK, Fine, Kaplan and Black, Philadelphia, PA MICHAEL BOUDIN, U.S. Court of Appeals, First Circuit, Boston, MA WILLIAM M. BURKE, Shearman & Sterling (retired), Costa Mesa, CA GERHARD CASPER, Stanford University, Stanford, CA EDWARD H. COOPER, University of Michigan Law School, Ann Arbor, MI N. LEE COOPER, Maynard, Cooper & Gale, Birmingham, AL GEORGE H. T. DUDLEY, Dudley, Topper and Feuerzeig, St. Thomas, U.S. VI CHRISTINE M. DURHAM, Utah Supreme Court (retired), Salt Lake City, UT CONRAD K. HARPER, Simpson Thacher & Bartlett (retired), New York, NY D. BROCK HORNBY, U.S. District Court, District of Maine, Portland, ME MARY KAY KANE, University of California, Hastings College of the Law, San Francisco, CA CAROLYN DINEEN KING, U.S. Court of Appeals, Fifth Circuit, Houston, TX PIERRE N. LEVAL, U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, New York, NY BETSY LEVIN, Washington, DC HANS A. LINDE, Portland, OR MARTIN LIPTON, Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz, New York, NY MYLES V. LYNK, Arizona State University, Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law, Phoenix, AZ JOHN J. MCKETTA III, Graves, Dougherty, Hearon & Moody, Austin, TX ROBERT H. MUNDHEIM, Shearman & Sterling, New York, NY HARVEY S. PERLMAN, University of Nebraska College of Law, Lincoln, NE ELLEN ASH PETERS, Connecticut Supreme Court (retired), Hartford, CT MARY M. SCHROEDER, U.S. Court of Appeals, Ninth Circuit, Phoenix, AZ ROBERT A. STEIN, University of Minnesota Law School, Minneapolis, MN MICHAEL TRAYNOR\*\*, Cobalt LLP, Berkeley, CA BILL WAGNER, Wagner McLaughlin, Tampa, FL WILLIAM H. WEBSTER, Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy, Washington, DC HERBERT P. WILKINS, Concord, MA

<sup>\*</sup>President Emeritus

<sup>\*\*</sup>President Emeritus and Chair of the Council Emeritus

# Restatement of the Law Children and the Law Tentative Draft No. 2

# Comments and Suggestions Invited

We welcome comments on this draft. They may be submitted via the website <u>project page</u> or sent via email to <u>RLCHLcomments@ali.org</u>. Comments will be forwarded directly to the Reporters, the Director, and the Deputy Director. You may also send comments via standard mail; contact information appears below.

Unless expressed otherwise in the submission, individuals who submit comments authorize The American Law Institute to retain the submitted material in its files and archives, and to copy, distribute, publish, and otherwise make it available to others, with appropriate credit to the author. Comments will be accessible on the website's project page as soon as they are posted by ALI staff. You must be signed in to submit or view comments.

### Reporter

Professor Elizabeth S. Scott Columbia Law School 435 West 116th Street Jerome Greene Hall, Room 715 New York, NY 10027-7297 Email: es2054@columbia.edu

### **Associate Reporters**

Professor Richard J. Bonnie University of Virginia School of Law 580 Massie Road, Room WB179D Charlottesville, VA 22903-1738 Email: rbonnie@virginia.edu

Professor Emily Buss
The University of Chicago Law
School
1111 East 60th Street, Ste. 1
Chicago, IL 60637-3281
Email: ebussdos@uchicago.edu

Professor Clare Huntington Fordham University School of Law 150 West 62nd Street, Room 7-104 New York, NY 10023-7407 Email: chuntington@law.fordham.edu Professor Solangel Maldonado Seton Hall University School of Law One Newark Center Newark, NJ 07102-5235 Email: solangel.maldonado@shu.edu

Dean David D. Meyer Tulane University Law School 6329 Freret Street, Ste. 210-A John Giffen Weinmann Hall New Orleans, LA 70118-6248 Email: meyer@tulane.edu

### Director

Professor Richard L. Revesz The Executive Office THE AMERICAN LAW INSTITUTE 4025 Chestnut Street Philadelphia, PA 19104-3099 Email: director@ALL.org

# **Deputy Director**

Ms. Stephanie A. Middleton The Executive Office THE AMERICAN LAW INSTITUTE 4025 Chestnut Street Philadelphia, PA 19104-3099 Email: smiddleton@ali.org

## Reporters' Conflicts of Interest

The project's Reporters may have been involved in other engagements on issues within the scope of the project; all Reporters are asked to disclose any conflicts of interest, or their appearance, in accord with the Policy Statement and Procedures on Conflicts of Interest with Respect to Institute Projects.

# Restatement of the Law Children and the Law

#### REPORTER

ELIZABETH S. SCOTT, Columbia Law School, New York, NY

### ASSOCIATE REPORTERS

RICHARD J. BONNIE, University of Virginia School of Law, Charlottesville, VA EMILY BUSS, University of Chicago Law School, Chicago, IL CLARE HUNTINGTON, Fordham University School of Law, New York, NY SOLANGEL MALDONADO, Seton Hall University School of Law, Newark, NJ DAVID D. MEYER, Tulane University Law School, New Orleans, LA

#### **ADVISERS**

KERRY ABRAMS, Duke University School of Law, Durham, NC SUSAN FRELICH APPLETON, Washington University School of Law, St. Louis, MO BARBARA A. ATWOOD, University of Arizona, James E. Rogers College of Law, Tucson, AZ

KATHARINE T. BARTLETT, Duke University School of Law, Durham, NC ANDREW K. BLOCK, Virginia Dept. of Juvenile Justice, Richmond, VA

SANFORD L. BOHRER, Holland & Knight, Miami, FL

BONNIE BRIER, Philadelphia, PA

MARGARET F. BRINIG, Notre Dame Law School, Notre Dame, IN

NAOMI R. CAHN, George Washington University School of Law, Washington, DC

ANNE C. DAILEY, University of Connecticut School of Law, Hartford, CT

ANDRE M. DAVIS, Baltimore City Law Department, Baltimore, MD

CHRISTINE M. DURHAM, Utah Supreme Court (retired), Salt Lake City, UT

MAXINE EICHNER, University of North Carolina School of Law, Chapel Hill, NC

ALLISON H. EID, U.S. Court of Appeals, Tenth Circuit, Denver, CO

IRA MARK ELLMAN, Berkeley, CA

ANTHONY C. EPSTEIN, Superior Court of the District of Columbia, Washington, DC

BARRY C. FELD, University of Minnesota Law School, Minneapolis, MN

JAMES FORMAN, JR., Yale Law School, New Haven, CT

DEBORAH FOWLER, Texas Appleseed, Austin, TX

VERNON L. FRANCIS, Dechert, Philadelphia, PA

HOLLY J. FUJIE, Los Angeles Superior Court, Los Angeles, CA

MARTIN GUGGENHEIM, New York University School of Law, New York, NY

KATHARINE S. HAYDEN, U.S. District Court, District of New Jersey, Newark, NJ

KRISTIN NICOLE HENNING, Georgetown University Law Center, Washington, DC

RICHARD B. KATSKEE, Americans United for Separation of Church and State, Washington, DC

JUDITH L. KREEGER, Eleventh Judicial Circuit of Florida, Miami, FL

DEBRA H. LEHRMANN, Texas Supreme Court, Austin, TX

GOODWIN LIU, California Supreme Court, San Francisco, CA

PETRA JIMENEZ MAES, New Mexico Supreme Court, Santa Fe, NM

AMIE C. MARTINEZ, Anderson, Creager & Wittstruck, Lincoln, NE

DOROTHY E. ROBERTS, University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, PA

JOHN B. ROE IV, Fifteenth Judicial Circuit Court of Illinois, Ogle County, Oregon, IL LAURA A. ROSENBURY, University of Florida, Levin College of Law, Gainesville, FL

LAURA A. ROSENBURT, University of Florida, Levin College of Law, Gainesville, FL

ROBERT G. SCHWARTZ, Philadelphia, PA

KATHERINE SILBAUGH, Boston University School of Law, Boston, MA

JANA B. SINGER, University of Maryland, Francis King Carey School of Law, Baltimore, MD

CATHERINE W. SMITH, Smith Goodfriend, Seattle, WA

JANE M. SPINAK, Columbia Law School, New York, NY
ELIZABETH G. TAYLOR, National Health Law Program, Washington, DC
CINDY G. THYER, Second Judicial District, Paragould, AR
AMY TOTENBERG, U.S. District Court, Northern District of Georgia, Atlanta, GA
MICHAEL S. WALD, Stanford Law School, Stanford, CA
DAVID N. WECHT, Pennsylvania Supreme Court, Pittsburgh, PA
LOIS WEITHORN, University of California, Hastings College of the Law, San Francisco, CA
BARBARA BENNETT WOODHOUSE, Emory University School of Law, Atlanta, GA

### SOCIAL SCIENCE ADVISORY PANEL

BJ CASEY, Sackler Institute for Developmental Psychobiology, New Haven, CT JEFFREY FAGAN, Columbia Law School, New York, NY THOMAS GRISSO, University of Massachusetts Medical School, Worcester, MA SARA MCLANAHAN, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ EDWARD P. MULVEY, University of Pittsburgh Western Psychiatric Institute & Clinic, Pittsburgh, PA N. DICKON REPPUCCI, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, VA LAURENCE STEINBERG, Temple University, Philadelphia, PA

### LIAISON

For the American Bar Association Task Force on Juvenile Justice MARSHA LEVICK, Juvenile Law Center, Philadelphia, PA

### MEMBERS CONSULTATIVE GROUP

### Restatement of the Law, Children and the Law

(as of March 20, 2019)

DIANE MARIE AMANN, Athens, GA DEBORAH GORDON KLEHR, Philadelphia, PA JOSÉ F. ANDERSON, Baltimore, MD MICHAEL J. KRAMER, Albion, IN CHRISTOPHER EDWARD APPEL, Washington, DC DAVID J. ARONOFSKY, Austin, TX JOSEPH R. BANKOFF, Atlanta, GA DEBRA LYN BASSETT, Los Angeles, CA SCOTT BERNSTEIN, Miami, FL BRIAN BIX, Minneapolis, MN KRISTINE BOWMAN, East Lansing, MI STEVEN M. BRADFORD, Muscatine, IA TONYA L. BRITO, Madison, WI BRYAN T. CAMP, Lubbock, TX ELENA A. CAPPELLA, Philadelphia, PA W. JONATHAN CARDI, Winston Salem, NC GILBERT PAUL CARRASCO, Salem, OR FRANK P. CERVONE, Philadelphia, PA STEPHEN YEE CHOW, Boston, MA JOHN J. CONNOLLY, Baltimore, MD MICHELLE WILLIAMS COURT, Los Angeles, CA MARY A. CROSSLEY, Pittsburgh, PA F. T. DAVIS JR., Atlanta, GA NORA V. DEMLEITNER, Lexington, VA NINA MARIA DETHLOFF, Bonn, Germany JENNIFER ANN DROBAC, Indianapolis, IN ALICE BECK DUBOW, Philadelphia, PA DAVID M. ENGLISH, Columbia, MO ANN L. ESTIN, Iowa City, IA KATIE R. EYER, Camden, NJ BORIS FELDMAN, Palo Alto, CA JUDITH K. FITZGERALD, Pittsburgh, PA JOSEPH Z. FLEMING, Miami, FL MATTHEW L.M. FLETCHER, East Lansing, MI KEM THOMPSON FROST, Houston, TX EDWARD M. GINSBURG, West Newton, MA MICHAEL GREENWALD, Philadelphia, PA CHARLES E. GRIFFIN, Ridgeland, MS JOANNA L. GROSSMAN, Dallas, TX EMILY HAMMOND, Washington, DC DAVID A. HARDY, Reno, NV MICHAEL A. HARRING, Moline, IL LESLIE JOAN HARRIS, Eugene, OR RONALD K. HENRY, Washington, DC

EVELYN V. KEYES, Houston, TX

RUFUS G. KING III, Washington, DC

MARK R. KILLENBECK, Fayetteville, AR

CHERYL A. KRAUSE, Philadelphia, PA MIRIAM A. KRINSKY, Los Angeles, CA ERIN C. LAGESEN, Salem, OR SYBIL H. LANDAU, New York, NY MÁXIMO LANGER, Los Angeles, CA PETER F. LANGROCK, Middlebury, VT JAYNEE LAVECCHIA, Morristown, NJ GEORGE W. LIEBMANN, Baltimore, MD WILLIAM PARKER LIGHTFOOT, Washington, DC KATHRYN V. LORIO, New Orleans, LA MEGHAN H. MAGRUDER, Atlanta, GA LINDA A. MALONE, Williamsburg, VA LINDA C. MCCLAIN, Boston, MA F. SCOTT MCCOWN, Austin, TX JAMES A. MCKENNA, Hallowell, ME M. ISABEL MEDINA, New Orleans, LA THOMAS C. MONTOYA, Albuquerque, NM J. THOMAS OLDHAM, Houston, TX JEFFREY A. PARNESS, DeKalb, IL LEROY PERNELL, Orlando, FL STEVEN N. PESKIND, Saint Charles, IL CHERYL B. PRESTON, Provo, UT BERNARD D. REAMS JR., San Antonio, TX REGINALD L. ROBINSON, Washington, DC MARGARET M. RUSSELL, Santa Clara, CA ROSEMARY C. SALOMONE, Jamaica, NY ANDREW IKE SCHEPARD, Hempstead, NY KATHARINE B. SILBAUGH, Boston, MA MARSHA E. SIMMS, New York, NY KENNETH W. SIMONS, Irvine, CA JONATHAN M. SMITH, Washington, DC CARL A. SOLANO, Philadelphia, PA ROBERT G. SPECTOR, Norman, OK H. MARK STICHEL, Baltimore, MD MARK P. STRASSER, Columbus, OH GUY MILLER STRUVE, New York, NY MARY ELLEN TABOR, Des Moines, IA EVAN M. TAGER, Washington, DC ANNE MINNETTE TAMAR-MATTIS, Cotati, CA LOUISE ELLEN TEITZ, Bristol, RI DAVID B. THRONSON, East Lansing, MI BEA VERSCHRAEGEN, Vienna, Austria LYNN DENNIS WARDLE, Provo, UT

MANNING GILBERT WARREN III, Louisville, KY
MICHAEL EVAN WATERSTONE, Los Angeles, CA
MERLE WEINER, Eugene, OR
STEVEN O. WEISE, Los Angeles, CA
ROBIN FRETWELL WILSON, Champaign, IL
CHARLES W. WOLFRAM, Berkeley, CA
BARBARA BENNETT WOODHOUSE, Atlanta, GA
RICHARD W. WRIGHT, Evanston, IL
MARK G. YUDOF, Berkeley, CA